

**IMPERIAL COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE  
MINUTES OF October 11, 2017 10:00 a.m.**

---

**VOTING MEMBERS PRESENT:**

City of Brawley	Rosanna Bayon Moore
City of Calexico	Armando Villa
City of Calipatria	Rom Medina (Chair)
City of El Centro	Marcela Piedra
City of Holtville	Nick Wells
County of Imperial	Rosa Lopez for Robin Hodgkin

**STAFF PRESENT:** Mark Baza, Kathi Williams, Virginia Mendoza, David Aguirre, Guillermo Gonzalez, Cristi Lerma

**OTHERS PRESENT:** David Salgado: SCAG; Jesus Vargas, Bing Luu: Caltrans; Tom Dubose

The following minutes are listed as they were acted upon by the Imperial County Transportation Commission Management Committee and as listed on the agenda for the meeting held Wednesday, October 11 2017 together with staff reports and related documents attached thereto and incorporated therein by reference.

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Medina called the Committee meeting to order at 10:49 a.m. Roll call was taken. Introductions were made.

**II. EMERGENCY ITEMS**

A. There were none.

**III. PUBLIC COMMENTS**

There were none.

**IV. CONSENT ITEMS**

A motion was made by [Bayon Moore](#) seconded by [Villa](#) to approve consent items 4A-B. **Motion carried** unanimously.

- A. Approved ICTC Management Committee Minutes for September 20, 2017
- B. Received and filed:
  - 1. ICTC Board Draft Minutes for September 27, 2017

**V. INFORMATION / DISCUSSION CALENDAR**

A. Discussion of the Holtville Airport

Mr. Dubose gave the Committee a presentation regarding the Holtville Airport and its current state of disrepair. The key challenges from the presentation were:

- Additional land may be needed
- The existing permit is under suspension
- Some of the land is owned by Bureau of Land Management

- More airspace is needed, and there is restricted airspace nearby owned by the military
- Creating a new facility versus rehabbing the old facility
- The most recent study was done on January 28, 2013

The key tasks moving forward are the following:

- Get the military on board
- Analyze specific information, such as previous study, a new feasibility study, finance
- Remove the suspension on the existing permit
- Environmental

B. Transit 101 2017 (Mobility Coordination)

Mr. Gonzalez stated that ICTC recently held its third annual Transit 101 session on October 4, 2017 at the ICTC office from 10:00 AM to 12:00 PM. The session is conducted in October during the regular Social Services Transportation Advisory Council (SSTAC) meeting.

Staff from Imperial Valley Transit (IVT); IVT Access, the Americans with Disabilities Act paratransit services; IVT RIDE, paratransit for seniors and persons with disabilities; and IVT MedTrans, the non-emergency transportation to medical facilities in San Diego, presented information on their specific services. In addition, the IVT branded service vehicles were on display in the parking lot.

Each year, a few new agencies attend gaining information that potentially enables them to better serve their clients' needs including but not limited to; the County Health Department, the County Behavioral Health Department, Pioneer's Memorial Hospital, Access for Independence and the Work Training Center.

C. 2<sup>nd</sup> Project Update – Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Section 5310 Grant Program for Elderly and Disabled Transportation Services FY 2014-15 (Mobility Coordination)

The Mobility Coordinator is responsible for assisting existing ICTC transit and contractor staff in addressing two primary areas:

1. The 2014 Human Services – Public Transit Coordinated Planning efforts goals; to use a bilingual Mobility Coordinator to bridge the gap between current public transit service providers, human service agencies, social service agencies and the senior citizen and disabled communities of Imperial County.
2. Address the recommendations in the consultant prepared ADA Certification and Eligibility Process, Demand Management Project; to revise the certification and eligibility process (implemented January 2017)

Mr. Gonzalez stated that since the approval of the Mobility Coordination grant he has been busy with providing outreach to local social services agencies; creating the "Do Not Leave Alone" Policy; providing ADA interviews; and, providing bilingual Facebook alerts. For the 4<sup>th</sup> year in a row IVT will be participating in the "Stuff a Bus" event where all canned foods and non-perishables will be used in lieu of fares, and they will be donated to the Imperial Valley Food Bank

In addition to the above stated, continued public outreach has been provided for the IVT MedTrans services in San Diego.

Mr. Gonzalez attached a list of the several individualized coordination and training sessions provided by the Mobility Coordinator directly, or with contractor's transit staff. The Mobility Coordinator has provided a needed and appreciated point of contact,

including some personalized case management for the community and in particular for seniors and persons with disabilities. Mr. Gonzalez provided an overview of key accomplishments to date.

**VI. REPORTS**

- A. ICTC Executive Director
  - A list of ICTC updates can be found on Page 22 of the agenda.
- B. Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG)
  - A list of SCAG updates can be found on Page 36 of the agenda.
- C. Caltrans Department of Transportation – District 11
  - A full report is on page 43 of the agenda.
- D. Committee Member Reports
  - There were none.

**VI. ACTION CALENDAR**

- A. 2018 State Transportation Improvement Program (STIP) Recommendations for Imperial County

Ms. Mendoza presented the Committee with the 2018 STIP Recommendations.

It was requested that the ICTC Management Committee forward this item to the Commission for review and approval after public comment, if any:

- 1. Approve the 2018 STIP Recommendations for Imperial County, requesting funding for the I-8/Imperial Avenue Interchange project and Planning, Programming and Monitoring (PPM). The funding request is as follows:

Project	Prior	FY18-19	FY19-20	FY20-21	FY21-22	FY22-23
I-8/Imperial Ave Interchange - existing	\$6,428		\$31,412			
I-8/Imperial Ave Interchange - additional <sup>1</sup>	+\$996		+\$3,244			
PPM - existing		\$300				
PPM – additional				+\$239	+\$239	+\$238
<b>Total – Proposed Revision</b>	<b>\$7,424</b>	<b>\$300</b>	<b>\$34,656</b>	<b>\$239</b>	<b>\$239</b>	<b>\$238</b>

A motion was made by [Piedra](#) seconded by [Bayon Moore](#), **Motion carried** unanimously.

- B. IVT Bus Operations Facility Evaluation Phase 1  
 Property: 1605 Adams Avenue, El Centro, Ca 92243

Mr. Aguirre provided the Committee with the results of the consultant’s study. Below are the options outlined in the staff report for consideration by the Commission.

Option A

Proceed with Phase 2 of the project and complete the comprehensive analysis of the Adams Avenue Facility. In addition, ICTC staff would return to the Commission for instruction to commence negotiations with Caltrans regarding the acquisition of the facility.

Pros: The site is larger than ICTC’s existing maintenance and operations facilities and

could assist with the goal of consolidating both the leased Ross Road and Industry Way locations.

Cons: Phase 1 has determined that the site would require extensive, costly rehabilitation and demolition to make it functional for the “move in ready” option. The site under the “move in ready” option would provide some upgrades over existing facilities but would not be sufficient for any future needs or expansion.

#### Option B

Do not proceed with the Phase 2 portion of the project, do not move forward with the acquisition of the Caltrans facility and look at other potential sites suitable for ICTC’s transit and administrative needs as previously directed by the Commission.

Pros: Saves the remaining funds previously allocated towards the Phase 2 of this project (\$180,041.00). Look at various other sites capable of meeting ICTC’s existing and future transit and administrative needs.

Cons: Time required in a search for a new site and continued use of the existing dual site scenario for maintenance and operations services.

#### Option C

Reallocate the Phase 2 budget (\$180,041.00) and utilize a portion of the budget to issue a contract amendment/change order with the existing consultant CH2M Hill to complete an initial study for a new site not to exceed (NTE) \$50,000 and work with a real estate consultant to review multiple potential sites.

Pros: Streamlines the process to complete preliminary engineering services for a new site while also utilizing existing budgeted funds. Engineering services would be performed by a consultant team already familiar with ICTC and the transit operations.

Cons: Engineering services would be limited to the existing consultant.

It was requested that the ICTC Management Committee forward this item to the Commission for review and approval after public comment, if any:

1. Proceeding with Option B:
  - a. Authorizing the Executive Director to cease the pursuit of the Caltrans facility.
2. Proceeding with Option C:
  - a. Authorizing the Executive Director to prepare a contract amendment/change order with the existing consultant (CH2M Hill) to complete an engineering analysis for a different potential transit maintenance and operations yard, with ICTC Administration building location from the existing project budget (Not To Exceed \$50,000).
  - b. Authorizing the Executive Director to engage a real estate consultant to look at multiple sites from the existing project budget.

A motion was made by [Wells](#) seconded by [Piedra](#), **Motion carried** unanimously.

Mr. Baza stated that these recommendations are consistent with the direction given to staff at the meeting in September.

C. IVT RIDE, Public Dial-a-Ride Paratransit Services, Triennial Review FY 2014-15 – FY 2016-17

Ms. Williams provided background information regarding the consolidation of the five public dial-a-ride services: Brawley, Calexico, El Centro, Imperial and the West Shores. Previously, there were multiple operators under separate contracts with these agencies.

In February 2014, fourteen transportation providers were invited to submit written proposals for consideration for the service branded as *IVT RIDE*, and with logo colors of yellow, black and white. The providers were requested to submit one proposal for all five of the paratransit services for a five year contract, with three one-year extensions. The new contract would be administered by ICTC.

The participating public agencies would terminate their individual contracts during a scheduled transition effective in FY 2014-15. However for accountability, a new Paratransit Coordination Committee (PCC) would be created by which the participating public agencies would review system performance, make recommendations and retain the ability to be responsive to their constituents.

Based on the results of the competitive bid process, it appeared that an opportunity to achieve greater efficiencies, better compliance with regulations, new technology for reservations/dispatching and performance management, and cost reductions could be achieved through the consolidation of the operations including; management, dispatch, reservationists, maintenance and marketing under one provider under one contract. Ultimately First Transit Inc. was selected as the most responsive provider.

Included in the service contract was the benefit of coordinated bilingual dispatching and a computerized reservation system, a fuel escalator for fuel prices that exceed the negotiated price per a gallon, a marketing and public outreach allowance (to be developed annually based on available funding per year), replacement of the any previous vehicles with fourteen (14) new, smaller and ramp equipped paratransit buses, in house maintenance support services and a dedicated management team.

ICTC procured the paratransit vehicles and service started in Brawley, Calexico, Imperial and the West Shores in FY 2014-15 with El Centro joining in FY 2016-17.

Data from the previous operators was not able to be verified related to passengers per day/hour etc. Therefore, service delivery began with the same service hours/days and fares as had been in operation under the previous City's' contracts. Shown below are the fares for each service area as follows:

Brawley - \$1.50   Calexico - \$1.00   El Centro - \$1.25   Imperial - \$1.75   West Shores - \$2.00

With the exception of the City of El Centro Service Area, service has been in operation for the demonstration period of three years. Staff have evaluated the services, the Paratransit Coordination Committee (PCC) has met a minimum of twice annually in each of the three years and recommendations for service changes have been developed.

Below are the system wide recommendations:

- Allow for limited hand carried bags on board
- Various - Increase fares, Reduce service hours, Reduce service days
- Reduce marketing expenses

- Reduce eligibility age for seniors from 60 to 55 years

Below are the specific recommendations for each service area:

### **Brawley**

The service in Brawley is provided with two buses M – F, one bus on Saturdays, and primarily focused on providing access to medical facilities in the area of the Pioneers' Hospital, Walmart, the Nutrition program at the Senior Center and Day Out facilities. The fare is \$1.50. Service in the PM after 3PM is very low. Service on Saturdays is very low. The farebox ratio is under the required 10%.

1. Maintain one bus with service hours on M – F 7AM to 6PM and the second bus reduce the service hours to 7 AM to 3PM.
2. Reduce the service hours on Saturdays from 7AM to 6PM, to 8AM to 2PM.

### **Calexico**

The service in Calexico is provided with three buses M – F, one bus on Saturdays and Sundays, and primarily focused on providing access to Walmart, the Nutrition program at the Senior Center and Alegria facilities. The fare is \$1.00. Service is steady on the weekdays and the weekend. The farebox ratio is under the required 10%.

1. Conduct more outreach
2. Raise fares

### **El Centro**

The service in El Centro is provided with four buses M – F, one bus on Saturdays, and primarily focused on providing access to medical facilities in the area of the ECRMC Hospital, medical facilities in the City of Imperial and along the La Brucherie Rd/Ross Rd, Walmart, the Nutrition program on Waterman Ave the Senior Center and Day Out facilities. The fare is \$1.25. Use of the service is increasing even though it has been in operation for only six months.

1. No changes recommended at this time.

### **Imperial**

The service in Imperial is provided with one bus M – F, one bus on Saturdays, and primarily focused on providing access to medical facilities in the City of Imperial and El Centro area programs and services including medical facilities in the area of the ECRMC Hospital, and along the La Brucherie Rd/Ross Rd, Walmart, the Nutrition program on Waterman Ave, the Senior Center and Day Out facilities. The fare is \$.75 in town and \$1.75 to and from El Centro. Service on Saturdays is very low. The farebox ratio is under the required 10%.

1. Reduce the four Saturdays a month to two Saturdays a month due to very low ridership
2. Increase fare to and from El Centro.
3. In a future competitive bid, consider combining service area of El Centro and Imperial into one contract/ scope of work to reduce any reporting and admin overhead costs.

### **West Shores**

The service in the area of the West Shores is provided with one bus and primarily focused on providing access to the IVT bus stop in Westmorland for activities in Westmorland and Brawley and return on Tuesdays, and access to the Nutrition program on Thursdays. The fare is \$2.00 in the community and \$3.00 to and from Westmorland. Service is low. The farebox ratio is under the required 10%.

1. Review a trip to Coachella/Indio instead of Westmorland and Brawley
2. Review a trip to the Brawley transfer terminal and Walmart w/o/wo a connection to the IVT bus stop in Westmorland on Tuesdays due to difficulty for seniors etc. in making the transfers.
3. Raise fare

4. Retire the service due to very high cost per passenger

The triennial performance data was also attached to the agenda for comparison.

After the recent review by the TDA Performance audit team, ICTC staff recommends that the service changes be implemented effective January 1, 2018, after a period of public notice. However, staff also recommends that any fare increases be deferred until a system wide fare study of all of the transit services can be completed during FY 2018-19.

It was requested that the ICTC Management Committee forward this item to the Commission for review and approval after public comment, if any:

1. Direct staff to implement the recommend changes to the service operations as of January 1, 2018 after public notice.
2. Direct staff to include the IVT RIDE services in a future system wide transit fare study.

A motion was made by [Bayon Moore](#) seconded by [Wells](#), **Motion carried** unanimously.

#### **VII. NEXT MEETING DATE AND PLACE**

The next meeting of the **Management Committee** will be held on **December 13, 2017** at the **City of Westmorland**, Westmorland, CA.

#### **VIII. ADJOURNMENT**

- A. Meeting adjourned at 12:17 p.m.